

| 1 | JOHN C. CRUDEN Assistant Attorney General | | | | |
|----|--|---|--|--|--|
| 2 | Environment and Natural Resources Division | | | | |
| 3 | JOSHUA H. VAN EATON (WA-39871) BETHANY ENGEL (MA-660840) | | | | |
| 5 | Trial Attorneys | | | | |
| 6 | U.S. Department of Justice P.O. Box 7611 | | | | |
| 7 | Washington DC 20044-7611 Telephone: (202) 514-5474 | | | | |
| 8 | Facsimile: (202) 514-0097 Email: Josh.Van.Eaton@usdoj.gov | | | | |
| 10 | Attorneys for Plaintiff United States of America | | | | |
| 11 | UNITED STATES I | DISTRICT COURT | | | |
| 12 | NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION | | | | |
| 13 | | | | | |
| 14 | SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION | | | | |
| 15 | | | | | |
| 16 | IN RE: VOLKSWAGEN "CLEAN) DIESEL" MARKETING, SALES | Civ. No. 3:16-cv-295 CRB (JSC) | | | |
| 17 | PRACTICES, AND PRODUCTS | STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] | | | |
| 18 | LIABILITY LITIGATION) | ORDER REGARDING CONFIDENTIALITY OF | | | |
| 19 | This Document Relates to: | SETTLEMENT DOCUMENTS AND DISCUSSIONS REGARDING CONTINUING SETTLEMENT | | | |
| 20 | United States of America v. Volkswagen) | DISCUSSIONS IN United States of | | | |
| 21 | AG, et al., Case No. 3:16-cv-00295 | America v. Volkswagen AG, et al. Case No 2:16-cv-10006 (E.D. Mich. 2016) | | | |
| 22 | | The Honorable Charles R. Breyer | | | |
| 23 | | | | | |
| 24 | | | | | |
| 25 | | | | | |
| 26 | | | | | |
| 27 | | | | | |
| 28 | | | | | |
| | CTIDLII ATION AND [DDODOGI | EDI ODDED DECADDING CONFIDENTIALITY OF CETTI EMENT | | | |

STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING CONFIDENTIALITY OF SETTLEMENT DOCUMENTS AND DISCUSSIONS REGARDING CONTINUING SETTLEMENT DISCUSSIONS MDL No. 2672 CRB (JSC)

WHEREAS, upon their own initiative and at the Court's direction with the assistance of the Settlement Master consistent with Pretrial Order No. 6 (Dkt. No. 973), the United States on behalf of the Environmental Protection Agency and Volkswagen AG; Audi AG; Volkswagen Group of America, Inc.; Volkswagen Group of America Chattanooga Operations LLC; Porsche AG; and Porsche Cars North America, Inc. (together, "Defendants" and collectively with the United States, "Parties") have been discussing and will continue to discuss pre-trial resolution of certain unresolved claims related to the VW Defendants' 2.0 liter and 3.0 liter diesel vehicles;

WHEREAS, the Parties wish to maintain the confidentiality of those discussions and any settlement-related documents related to those discussions, as well as any further discussions regarding the resolution of these claims;

WHEREAS, the Parties recognize that certain settlement-related documents or information may need to be shared among certain representatives of the Parties;

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and among the Parties:

- 1. Order on Confidentiality. Pursuant to the Court's inherent jurisdiction and Federal Rule of Evidence 408, every recipient of this Order shall treat all offers and agreements on settlement terms or agreements in principle between the Parties concerning such claims, including any appendices thereto, and all drafts of all term sheets, appendices, release agreements, consent decrees, and communications regarding resolution of such claims (including the substance of any discussions and any documents prepared in connection therewith) (collectively, "Settlement Documents and Communications") as strictly confidential.
- 2. Parties Authorized to Share Documents Internally. Counsel for the United States and the Defendants may share Settlement Documents and Communications, whether draft or final, concerning settlement discussions between the United States and the Defendants with any individual employed by or retained on behalf of the United States, or the Defendants, respectively, if that individual has a need to know the information to further resolution of these matters or if such information is otherwise required to perform their official duties.

- 3. Parties' Obligation to Maintain Custodian Lists. Government Coordinating Counsel, Defendants' Liaison Counsel for the Volkswagen Group Defendants, and Defendants' Liaison Counsel for the Porsche Defendants ("Coordinating Counsel") shall each keep a list of all individuals within the group for which it has coordinating authority who have received any Settlement Documents and Communications, which shall include the name, title and affiliation of each individual. Coordinating Counsel shall periodically provide updated copies of these lists to the Settlement Master. Except in the event of a good-faith claim of violation of this Order, Coordinating Counsel agree not to request copies of these lists or determine the identities of the individuals on them.
- 4. <u>Endorsing of Settlement Documents</u>. All Settlement Documents and Communications that are exchanged between the Parties and that are subject to the terms of this Confidentiality Order shall be endorsed as "Settlement Confidential Subject to US-VW Confidentiality Order, Civ. No. 16-295." Nothing in this Order shall limit the Parties' ability to exchange documents or communications consistent with the requirements of earlier confidentiality orders of this Court.
- 5. Sharing of Documents with Non-Parties. No one shall share Settlement Documents or Communications, whether draft or final, subject to this Order with any individual not employed by or retained on behalf of a Party, as defined herein, without express written consent by all Coordinating Counsel. Prior to receiving any Settlement Documents or Communications pursuant to this paragraph, each non-party individual must be provided a copy of this Order and must agree to be bound by it.
- 6. <u>Freedom of Information Act</u>. Settlement Documents and Communications shall be deemed exempt under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 U.S.C. § 552, absent good cause shown in this proceeding.
- 7. <u>Distribution of this Order</u>. Before December 28, 2016, the Parties shall provide a copy of this Order to all persons who have been included in settlement discussions. Parties are

Case 3:16-cv-00295-CRB Document 45 Filed 01/04/17 Page 4 of 6

| 1 | obligated to provide a copy of this Order to all individuals named on the custodian lists provide | | |
|-----|---|--|--|
| 2 | to the Settlement Master as provided in Paragraph 3 of this Order. | | |
| 3 | 8. <u>Sanctions</u> . Any person found to be in violation of this Order will be subject to | | |
| 4 | imposition of sanctions. | | |
| 5 | Dated: December 23, 2016 Respectfully submitted, | | |
| 6 | By: /s/ Bethany Engel | | |
| 7 | Joshua H. Van Eaton | | |
| 0 | josh.van.eaton@usdoj.gov | | |
| 8 | Bethany Engel bethany.engel@usdoj.gov | | |
| 9 | Environmental Enforcement Section | | |
| 10 | Environment and Natural Resources Division | | |
| 10 | UNITED STATES | | |
| 11 | DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE | | |
| | P.O. Box 7611 | | |
| 12 | Washington, DC 20044-7611 | | |
| 13 | Telephone: (202) 514-6892 | | |
| | Facsimile: (202) 514-0097 | | |
| 14 | Coordinating Counsel for the United States | | |
| 15 | Dated: December 23, 2016 Respectfully submitted, | | |
| 16 | | | |
| 17 | By: <u>/s/ Robert J. Giuffra, Jr.</u> Robert J. Giuffra, Jr. | | |
| 1.0 | giuffrar@sullcrom.com | | |
| 18 | Sharon L. Nelles | | |
| 19 | nelless@sullcrom.com William B. Monahan | | |
| | monahanw@sullcrom.com | | |
| 20 | SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP | | |
| 21 | 125 Broad Street | | |
| | New York, New York 10004 Telephone: (212) 558-4000 | | |
| 22 | Facsimile: (212) 558-3588 | | |
| 23 | Laura Kabler Oswell | | |
| | oswelll@sullcrom.com | | |
| 24 | SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP | | |
| 25 | 1870 Embarcadero Road Palo Alto, California 94303 | | |
| | Telephone: (650) 461-5600 | | |
| 26 | Facsimile: (650) 461-5700 | | |
| 27 | Co-Liaison Counsel for the Volkswagen Group | | |
| 20 | Defendants | | |
| 28 | | | |
| | C | | |

Case 3:16-cv-00295-CRB Document 45 Filed 01/04/17 Page 5 of 6

| 1 | Dated: December 23, 2016 | Respectfully submitted, | | |
|----|--|--|--|--|
| 2 | | By: /s/ Jeffrey L. Chase | | |
| 3 | | Jeffrey L. Chase | | |
| 4 | | jchase@herzfeld-rubin.com Michael B. Gallub | | |
| | | mgallub@herzfeld-rubin.com | | |
| 5 | | HERZFELD & RUBIN, P.C. 125 Broad Street | | |
| 6 | | New York, New York 10004 | | |
| 7 | | Telephone: (212) 471-8500 | | |
| 8 | | Co-Liaison Counsel for the Volkswagen Group | | |
| 9 | | Defendants | | |
| 10 | Dated: December 23, 2016 | Respectfully submitted, | | |
| 11 | | By: <u>/s/ Cari Dawson</u> | | |
| 12 | | Cari Dawson | | |
| | | Alston & Bird 1201 West Peachtree Street | | |
| 13 | | Suite 4900 | | |
| 14 | | Atlanta, Georgia 30309 Cari.Dawson@alston.com | | |
| 15 | | Can. Dawson@aiston.com 404.881.7766 | | |
| | | | | |
| 16 | | Liaison Counsel for the Porsche Defendants | | |
| 17 | | | | |
| 18 | | | | |
| 19 | | | | |
| 20 | | | | |
| 21 | | | | |
| 22 | | | | |
| 23 | | * * * | | |
| 24 | PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED. | | | |
| 25 | | | | |
| 26 | DATED:, 2017. | CHARLES R. BREYER | | |
| 27 | | United States District Judge | | |
| | | | | |
| 28 | | | | |
| | STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED] ORDER REGARDING CONFIDENTIALITY OF SETTLEMENT | | | |

Case 3:16-cv-00295-CRB Document 45 Filed 01/04/17 Page 6 of 6

| 1 | <u>ATTESTATION</u> | | | | |
|----|--|--|--|--|--|
| | Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), the filer of this document attests that | | | | |
| 2 | concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from the other signatories above. | | | | |
| 3 | | | | | |
| 4 | Dated: December 23, 2016 By: <u>/s/ Bethany Engel</u> Bethany Engel | | | | |
| 5 | | | | | |
| 6 | | | | | |
| 7 | | | | | |
| 8 | | | | | |
| 9 | | | | | |
| 10 | | | | | |
| 11 | | | | | |
| 12 | | | | | |
| 13 | | | | | |
| 14 | | | | | |
| 15 | | | | | |
| 16 | | | | | |
| 17 | | | | | |
| 18 | | | | | |
| 19 | | | | | |
| 20 | | | | | |
| 21 | | | | | |
| 22 | | | | | |
| 23 | | | | | |
| 24 | | | | | |
| 25 | | | | | |
| 26 | | | | | |
| 27 | | | | | |
| 28 | -5- | | | | |